```
IVOA Telecon 22: TM22
=====================


08 Mar 2007: 15.00 - 17.00 GMT


Notes: NAW                                      orig    08 Mar 2007
                                                revised 13 May 2007


Present:

Executive or Representatives:

Christophe Arviset        <Christophe.Arviset@esa.int>    CA      Euro-VO/ESA
Fernando Comerom          <fcomeron@eso.org>              FC      Euro-VO/ESO
Chenzhou Cui              <ccz@bao.ac.cn>                 CC      China-VO
Dave De Young             <deyoung@noao.edu>              DY      NVO
Francoise Genova          <genova@astro.u-strasbg.fr>     FG      F-VO
Bob Hanisch               <hanisch@stsci.edu>             BH      NVO
Ajit Khembavi             <akk@iucaa.ernet.in>            AK      India-VO
Oleg Malkov               <malkov@inasan.ru>              OM      RVO
Reagan Moore              <moore@sdsc.edu>                RM      NVO
Masatoshi Ohishi          <masatoshi.ohishi@nao.ac.jp>    MO      JVO
Paolo Padovani            <ppadovan@eso.org>              PP      Euro-VO/ESO
Fabio Pasian              <pasian@ts.astro.it>            FP      DRACO
Bruno Rino                <brino@eso.org>                 BR      DocCoord
Wolfgang Voges            <wvoges@mpe.mpg.de>             WV      GAVO
Nic Walton                <naw@ast.cam.ac.uk>             NW      AstroGrid
Roy Williams              <roy@cacr.caltech.edu>          RW      NVO


Apologies:

Areg Mickaelian           <aregmick@apaven.am>            AM      ArVO
Andrew Lawrence           <al@roe.ac.uk>                  AL      AstroGrid
David Schade              <David.Schade@nrc.ca>           DS      CVO
Enrique Solano            <Enrique.Solano@esa.int>        ESo     SVO



There was no representation from the Aus-VO, HVO or VO-Korea



Glossary

ArVO - Armenian VO                          www.aras.am/arvo.htm
AstroGrid - UK VO initiative                www.astrogrid.org
Aus-VO - Australian Virtual Observatory     www.aus-vo.org
CDS - Centre de Donnes Astronomiques de Strasbourg  www.cdsweb.u-strasbg.fr
China-VO - Chinese Virtual Observatory      www.china-vo.org
CVO - Canadian Virtual Observatory
Euro-VO European Virtual Observatory        www.euro-vo.org
F-VO - VO-France                            www.france-vo.org
GAVO - German Virtual Observatory           www.g-vo.org
GSC - UK Grid Steering Committee
HVO - Hungarian Virtual Observatory         hvo.elte.hu
VO-India - Indian Virtual Observatory
VObs.it - The Italian Virtual Observatory
JVO - Japanese Virtual Observatory          jvo.nao.ac.jp/index-e.html
KVO - Korean Virtual Observatory            kvo.kao.re.kr
NVO - National Virtual Observatory          www.us-vo.org
PDS - AAS Division of Planetary Sciences
RVO - Russian Virtual Observatory           www.inasan.rssi.ru/eng/rvo/
SVO - Spanish Virtual Observatory           www.laeff.esa.es/svo/

IVOA - International Virtual Observatory Alliance http://www.ivoa.net
```

Agenda:

1. Roll Call and Agenda
2. Minutes of TM21
3. Review of Actions
4. Approval of new IVOA Recommendation(s) [Standing Item]
5. Status of the IVOA assessment (FG/DDY)

6. WG/IG/Standardisation process: RW to report on:
   * Recommendation process
   * Nominations for vice chairs: DAL, others (DM?, Apps?)
   * Status report on Apps WG, SSA, SIA, VOQL, Characterisation
   * Preparation of the yearly TCG Coordinator report (due May 2007 Interop)

7. Preparation of the review of the WG/IG chairs (due May 2007
   Interop) (FG/DDY/RW)

8. Status of the Assessment of Implementation of IVOA standards in
   Data Centres (DS/CA)

9. Status of the preparation of the Beijing Interoperability meeting (CC)
10. Status of the preparation of the Fall (2007) Interop meeting (NW)
11. Date and Venue of the next Exec meeting (Beijing)
12. AOB
13. Summary of Actions

A. Appendices – reports from the VOprojects – see the wiki at
http://www.ivoa.net/twiki/bin/view/IVOA/IvoaExecMeetingTM22

* NEXT MEETING (Time TBC)*

1. Roll Call

The participants – as listed above – introduced themselves, with
apologies noted.

2. Previous minutes.

Notes from meeting 2006–12–05 – at
http://www.ivoa.net/internal/IVOA/IvoaRepMin/ivoa–tm21–20061205.pdf

AGREED

2.1 Reports from VO projects and WG/IGs (to be uploaded to web page)

These are located at
http://www.ivoa.net/twiki/bin/view/IVOA/IvoaExecMeetingTM21.
FG encouraged all to upload reports if not yet done.

3. Review of open action items from previous meetings and their new
   status

ACTION FM19–3A EXEC Chair: ensure that there is an agenda item for
each May Exec meeting to receive and discuss the yearly TCG
Coordinator report on the IVOA technical status/roadmap

ONGOING: will happen at the next May 2007 Exec meeting. (see also
discussion in item 9)

ACTION FM20–3D RW/FG – generate draft procedure to be followed in
terms of delivery of draft specs c.f the WG roadmap, and the procedure

to follow when specs are delayed.

ONGOING: RW to report - closeout aim is for May 2007 - see item 6
below.

ACTION: FM20-8B TCG: review status of WG/IG Chairs - report at the May
2007 Exec meeting.

ONGOING: RW to update - see item 6 and 7 of this telecon.

ACTION TM21-2 NW: add date of next meeting to the front of the report/
minutes.

CLOSED: Done

ACTION TM21-5A: FG/DdY: issue draft questionnaire text to EXEC by 11
Dec 2006. - see discussion in item 5.

CLOSED: questionnaire issued and available online at
http://www.ivoa.net/pub/assessment2007.html

ACTION TM21-5B: BR - will set up a web form to accept input - this
will allow for anonymous and named response.

CLOSED: see http://www.ivoa.net/pub/assessment2007.html

ACTION TM21-6.2A RW: contact Jonathan McDowell to ask for a DM Vice
Chair nomination.

CLOSED: RW to report - see item 6.

ACTION TM21-6.2A RW: contact Doug Tody to ask on who should be
recommended for Vice Chair of DAL-WG.

CLOSED: RW to report - see item 6.

ACTION TM21-6.3 Mark Allen: bring forward a charter and roadmap for
the activities of a proposed Apps-WG. This would be then considered by
the IVOA Exec, decision by email.

CLOSED: charter and roadmap for the Apps-WG AGREED 29 Jan 2007 by the
IVOA Exec

ACTION TM21-6.4: FG/ DdY - to generate a proposal for selection/
renewal of Chairs - by end Feb 2007. Agreement on this at the May 2007
InterOp.

ONGOING: FG/ DdY to update - see itme 7.

ACTION TM21-6.5A RW: Request a report from Doug Tody on the timescale
for the submission of the first Working Draft of the SSA std. Need to
aim for Mid Feb 2007.

CLOSED: RW to report - see item 6.

ACTION TM21-6.5B RW: Request a report from Pedro Osuna on the
timescale for the submission of the first Working Draft of the ADQL &
TAP stds.

CLOSED: see report from Pedro Osuna at
http://www.ivoa.net/twiki/bin/view/IVOA/IvoaExecMeetingTM21#VOQL_WG
. Expected deliveries: 1.Refurbished ADQL doc in quite a mature state
by China 2007 interop. 2.First draft of the Table Access Protocol
(TAP) doc by China 2007 interop.

ACTION TM21-6.5C BH: organise with Ray Plante, APM as to how the EPO

metadata document should move forward.

CLOSED: BH reported that the EPO document would be considered by the
Registry WG (with the Semantics-WG will be kept up to date with
progress).

ACTION TM21-7 DS: once the reflection period had ended – a telecon
should be set up for interested parties to discuss data compliance –
perhaps Mar/Apr 2007.

ONGOING: see item 8.

ACTION TM21-9A NW: report back as to Oct 2007 Interop venue.

CLOSED: InterOp will be 27-28 Sep 2007 at the IoA, Cambridge, UK

ACTION TM21-9B EXEC – suggestions to FG re possible venue/ form of an
Oct 2008 meeting.

ONGOING: FG reported that proposals still welcome. Could be with a
small projects meeting, perhaps in South America. AK suggested India as
a possibility. (FG noted that decision would be after the IVOA
assessment).

ACTION TM21-11 FG: Confirm next meeting time – 8 March 2007 @ 15.00GMT

CLOSED: Meeting 8 Mar 2007

4. Approval of new IVOA Recommendation(s)

FG noted that there were no new recommendations (since the Dec 2006
TM21 meeting).

FG also noted that the small modifications needed to be made to
progress the two recommendations provisionally approved in Dec 2006
have not been made.

BH thought that the Resource Metadata had been updated.

ACTION TM22-4A Ray Plante – check final mods to the Identifiers and the
RM documents.

FG – comments from some WG leaders still required for the UCD1+
controlled vocabulary Version 1.21. FG noted that recommendations
should not be held up if only one WG leader fails to respond.

ACTION TM22-4B RW to summarise the required steps to progress UCD1+
controlled vocabulary Version 1.21.

AGREED: process for answering the RFC's:

- All WGs polled for their comments with a 2 week timeline

- Those that do not answer get a second reminder email with a one week
response time.

- At the end of this period the TCG-Chair reviews the completeness of
the returned comments, and if there are missing WG comments to note
this. The Exec will then decide whether the recommendation should
progress or not.

5. Status of the IVOA assessment (FG/DDY)

DdY reported on the assessment at

http://www.ivoa.net/pub/assessment2007.html

There were 41 responses. These 41 responses (some to be edited) will
be circulated to the Exec now.

DdY reported that from a quick analysis the following areas of were of
concern:

Q2. Is the IVOA proceeding toward its goals (as defined in documents
    available from ivoa.net) in a satisfactory manner and on a
    satisfactory time scale?

Most responders had concerns in this area.

Q8. Is the internal structuring of the WG/IGs working well?

Q9. Is there sufficient communication and collaboration among the
    various IVOA WG/IGs?

Some responders thought there were serious problems

Q11. Is communication between the IVOA and the 'outside world'
     adequate? If not, what changes need to be made?

This generated the most concern

Q15. Are the Small Project Meetings effective? If not, how do they
need to be changed?

This area generated some concern.

On the positive side the following areas were good:

Q3. Is the IVOA Exec sufficiently responsive to the needs of the IVOA
    community?

Q6. The IVOA Working Groups (WG) and Interest Groups (IG) are
generally organized as the interest and need arises. Is this process
working well?

Q13. Do the goals of the IVOA Interop meetings meet the needs of the
IVOA?

Q16. Are the mailing lists sufficiently complete and in a useful form?

In discussion it was noted that there would need to be some extended
consideration of the assessment.

ACTION TM22-5A FG/DdY – distribute questionnaire material and analysis
to the Exec before the May Beijing meeting.

ACTION TM22-5B Exec – all encouraged to complete the questionnaire.

6. WG/IG/Standardisation process

6.1 Recommendation process (Identifiers, Registry Metadata, UCD list)

ACTION TM22-6.1 RW/BH – to check that the submission process as
defined at http://www.ivoa.net/Documents/#process is proving to be
sufficient in practise.

6.2 Nominations for vice chairs

It was AGREED that Mark Taylor would be the vice-Chair of the
Applications-WG.

It was AGREED that Markus Dolensky would be Vice Chair of the DAL-WG.

It was AGREED that Mireille Louys and Anita Richards would become the
vice-Chairs for the DM-WG.

BH raised some concern as to the issue of multiple
vice-Chairs. However, for the case of the DM-WG the Exec would approve
the two VC's. This would be reviewed at the May 2007 Interop.

FG noted the upcoming review of Chairs and Vice-Chairs at the Beijing
meeting.

6.3 Status report on Apps WG, SSA, SIA, VOQL, Characterisation

RW reported on the the following:

- Apps-WG - lots of activity on the applications messaging std.

- SSAP - a WD 1.0 specification is to be published in advance of the
  Beijing meeting (expected early Apr 2007)

- SIAP v2.0 - this is developing - v2.0 will run in parallel to SIAP
  v1.0 as there are many SIAP v1.0 services.

- TAP v1.0 - work is progressing within the VOQL-TEG with interfaces
  between the VOQL and DAL WGs with the aim of having a first draft of
  the Table Access Protocol (TAP) doc by China 2007 interop

- GWS stds - certificates and authentication are emerging
  issues. Interoperability between grids is now important.

- VOSPACE has reached a v1.0 protocol - this now needs to be used.

- Characterisation std - overlapping with STC

- STC - this std needs some attention. The current draft std may be
  overly complicated in terms of implementations. Failure to agree it
  is now impacting on other stds.

ACTION TM22-6.3 RW - to discuss with the DM-WG the route forward
with the STC std - and whether there is a place for a subset of STC for
operational use in some cases.

6.4 Preparation of the yearly TCG Coordinator report (due for May 2007
  Interop)

RW reported that a draft will be available before the interop - and
that the full report will be produced after the InterOP (to allow for
inclusion of comment at the InterOp).

7. Preparation of the review of the WG/IG chairs (due for May 2007
   Interop)

DdY reported that outgoing Chairs should be consulted as to
recommendations for in-coming Chairs.

The proposal is that the IVOA Exec Chair, Chair of the TCG and out
going Chair should review candidates for the new in-coming Chair. FG

FG noted that the VO Projects are also invited to submit names for
consideration.

It was CLARIFIED (by DdY in request to a question from BH) that there
are NO fixed limits on the number of re-appointments that can take
place. Thus three year appointments in the first place, and repeating
one year re-appointments are allowable.

RW reported that the following WG Chairs have been in place for more
than three years:

DAL - Doug Tody
GWS - Guy Rixon
DM - Jonathan McDowell
VOTable - Francois Ochsenbein

FG noted that the review of the IG Chairs will also be required.

ACTION TM22-7 EXEC/ WG/IG Chairs - send suggestions to FG/RW as to
possible follow-on Chairs. Review in May 2007.

8. Status of the Assessment of Implementation of IVOA standards in
   Data Centres

CA reported on behalf of DS that the list of 'working services' had
been circulated (mid Nov 2006). No comments on this list had been
received to date. It was suggested that DS re-send the request for
comment from the projects.

BH reported on his recent assessment of VO services. He noted that
some older services have reliability issues.

BH also noted that curation activities of resources entered in
the registry will become more significant as VO projects move to
support operational facilities and services.

9. Status of the preparation of the Beijing Interoperability meeting (CC)

CC reported that preparations are going well. See
http://www.ivoa.net/twiki/bin/view/IVOA/InterOpMay2007 and
http://www.china-vo.org/en/events/ivoa07/

All should register soon at
https://www.china-vo.org/en/events/ivoa07/registration.shtml

ACTION TM22-9 CC to email all at interop@ivoa.net to remind all
potential attendees that they may need to sort out their visas in
advance of travelling to China.

BH: requested input from all if there are improvements on
the interoperability meeting organization that could be
made. Draft agenda will be issued soon.

10. Status of the preparation of the Fall (2007) Interop meeting

NW noted that the next Autumn InterOp would be at the IoA, Cambridge,
27+28 Sep 2007.

11. Date and Venue of the next Exec meeting (Beijing)

Exec meeting will be Sunday 13 May 2007. Start at 17.00 local
time. Meeting will likely be 3 hours.

ACTION TM22-11 RW: Confirm time (soon) of TCG telecon before the May
Beijing meeting.

12. AOB

None

13. Summary of Actions

NEW ACTIONS:

ACTION TM22-4A Ray Plante – check final mods to the Identifiers and the
RM documents.

ACTION TM22-4B RW to summarise the required steps to progress UCD1+
controlled vocabulary Version 1.21.

ACTION TM22-5A FG/DdY – distribute questionnaire material and analysis
to the Exec before the May Beijing meeting.

ACTION TM22-5B Exec – all encouraged to complete the questionnaire.

ACTION TM22-6.1 RW/BH – to check that the submission process as
defined at http://www.ivoa.net/Documents/#process is proving to be
sufficient in practise.

ACTION TM22-6.3 RW – to discuss with the DM-WG the route forward
with the STC std – and whether there is a place for a subset of STC for
operational use in some cases.

ACTION TM22-7 EXEC/ WG/IG Chairs – send suggestions to FG/RW as to
possible follow-on Chairs. Review in May 2007.

ACTION TM22-9 CC to email all at interop@ivoa.net to remind all
potential attendees that they may need to sort out their visas in
advance of travelling to China.

ACTION TM22-11 RW: Confirm time (soon) of TCG telecon before the May
Beijing meeting.

ONGOING ACTIONS:

ACTION FM19-3A EXEC Chair: ensure that there is an agenda item for
each May Exec meeting to receive and discuss the yearly TCG
Coordinator report on the IVOA technical status/roadmap

ONGOING: will happen at the next May 2007 Exec meeting. (see also
discussion in item 9)

ACTION FM20-3D RW/FG – generate draft procedure to be followed in
terms of delivery of draft specs c.f the WG roadmap, and the procedure
to follow when specs are delayed.

ONGOING: RW to report – closeout aim is for May 2007 – see item 6
below.

ACTION: FM20-8B TCG: review status of WG/IG Chairs – report at the May
2007 Exec meeting.

ONGOING: RW to update – see item 6 and 7 of this telecon.

ACTION TM21-6.4: FG/ DdY – to generate a proposal for selection/

renewal of Chairs – by end Feb 2007. Agreement on this at the May 2007 InterOp.

ONGOING: FG/ DdY to updated – see item 7.

ACTION TM21-7 DS: once the reflection period had ended – a telecon should be set up for interested parties to discuss data compliance – perhaps Mar/Apr 2007.

ONGOING: see item 8.

ACTION TM21-9B EXEC – suggestions to FG re possible venue/ form of an Oct 2008 meeting.

ONGOING: FG reported that proposals still welcome. Could be with a small projects meeting, perhaps in South Africa. AK suggested India as a possibility. (FG noted that decision would be after the IVOA assessment).

GMT 17:00 – Close of meeting

A. Appendices – reports from the VOprojects.

----------------- APPENDICES ---------------

Note: all VO and WG reports are now available on the meeting wiki page at
http://www.ivoa.net/twiki/bin/view/IVOA/IvoaExecMeetingTM22